



## Agenda item 4

### Minutes

## Bristol City Council Minutes of the Place Scrutiny Commission

Friday 5 December 2014 at 11.00 am

---

#### **Members present:**

Councillor Bolton, Councillor Hiscott (Chair for the meeting), Councillor Khan, Councillor Jackson, Councillor Mead (for Councillor Pearce) Councillor Negus

#### **Officers in attendance:**

Shahzia Daya – Deputy Monitoring Officer  
Bill Edrich – Commercial Director Energy  
Steve Crawshaw - Programme Co-ordinator, Sustainability Services  
Johanna Holmes, Policy Adviser – Scrutiny  
Paul Isbell – Energy Service Manager  
Shana Johnson, Democratic Services Manager  
Mareike Schmidt – Service Manager Energy  
Alex Minshull – Sustainable City and Climate Change Service Manager  
David White – Programme Manager Energy

#### **54. Apologies for absence, substitutions and introductions** (agenda item 1)

Apologies were received from Councillors Martin, Pearce, Threlfall and Windows.

#### **55. Declarations of interest** (agenda item 2)

None.

#### **56. Public forum** (agenda item 3)

Public forum items were received as follows:

**Questions:**

**Question 1 - question from Julie Boston**

Subject: 24/25 bus service

A written officer response was provided at the meeting. In response to a supplemental question on actions taken by councillors in respect of the 24/25 service it was agreed to provide more detail to the questioner.

**Question 2 - question from Jane Cunningham**

Subject: Air quality – 20 mph zones

A written officer response was provided at the meeting.

**Statements:**

The following statements were received:

**Statement 1 - statement from Helen Pillinger**

Subject: Air quality

**Statement 2 – statement from Cllr Anthony Negus**

Subject: Air quality

**Statement 3 – statement from Stephen Barrett**

Subject: Air quality

**57. Minutes - Place Scrutiny Commission – 17<sup>th</sup> November 2014**  
(agenda item 4)

**RESOLVED:**

**That the minutes of the meeting of the commission held on 17<sup>th</sup> November be confirmed as a correct record and signed by the Chair subject to the following amendment to 52 (g) Public Transport Update on best practice:**

“Powys and Dorset have aggregated all home to school, SEN and tendered services provision into single supplier contracts”.

**58. Action sheet – Place Scrutiny Commission – 17<sup>th</sup> November 2014**  
(agenda item 5)

The commission noted and reviewed the action sheet relating to the 17<sup>th</sup> November meeting.

**RESOLVED: that outstanding actions be followed up by the Policy Adviser, Scrutiny.**

**59. Work programme 2014/15**  
(agenda item 6)

The commission considered the latest update of the work programme.

Summary of main points raised / noted:

- a. Councillor Negus raised concerns about the scope of the recent Waste Inquiry and the limited input from Place Commission given that this was billed as a joint Inquiry. It was noted that there will be a further Inquiry and that this will be jointly scoped between Place and Neighbourhoods.
- b. The Homes Commission draft report for the next meeting will be considered at the Planning Meeting on the 11<sup>th</sup> December.

**RESOLVED: that the latest update of the work programme, and the above comments, be noted.**

**60. Whipping**  
(agenda item 7)

None reported.

**61. Chair's business**  
(agenda item 8)

None reported.

**62. Key decisions**  
(agenda item 9)

The commission considered the latest update, setting out details of key decisions scheduled to be taken by the Mayor at Cabinet.

Summary of main points raised / noted:

- a. Cllr Negus raised concerns that the Port of Bristol – Freehold Property decision was not scheduled to come back to Place Scrutiny and requested that this happen. This was supported by Cllr Mead. The Deputy Monitoring Officer advised that she would need to check the wording of the original decision in April before advising whether this would be appropriate.

**RESOLVED:**  
**That the update and the above comments be noted.**

**63. Air quality update**  
(agenda item 10)

The commission considered a report setting out information on the following topics:

1. Air Quality in Bristol.
2. Actions being undertaken to improve air quality.
3. Plans for the future development of actions to improve air quality.

Summary of main points raised / noted:

**Air Quality:**

- a. The level of most pollutants is better than the UK objectives but Nitrogen Dioxide is worse than the objective on city centre roads and arterial routes.
- b. The Council is undertaking a wide range of action to reduce emissions from transport and thereby improve air quality and has been successful in securing additional funding from Government and European Commission to invest in measures such as cleaner buses and electric charging points.
- c. Work has commenced on the development of an Air Quality Strategy and has undertaken research to help inform the development of plans. Since the solutions to air quality problems lie in wider transport and place related issues, the air quality actions will form part of wider plans - the exact form of which have not yet been developed. Integration of the plans is crucial given the significant role of transport in air quality and there needs to be systemic change to transport in the city.
- d. There either need to be cleaner vehicles or less vehicle movement in the City to improve air quality.

**Air Quality and Monitoring in Avonmouth:**

- a. There is no evidence that air quality exceeds government targets in Avonmouth. Monitoring does still take place in Avonmouth and currently monitoring is being undertaken with Public Health England in the Port area. In addition there is monitoring in a very small area where the M5 crosses Avonmouth Road. There is no evidence to suggest industrial processes are causing a problem in terms of threatening breaches in air quality standards.
- b. Cllr Mead raised queries about dust in the air during the summer in Avonmouth. It was explained that dust in the air does not necessarily relate to exceedance of air quality standards. Nuisance dust is dealt with under the pollution control regime and samples have been taken to ascertain the problem. There will be a report from in the new year.

**Air Quality Monitoring/Actions**

- a. In response to questions it was clarified that the actions set out are all being undertaken at present but what has not yet been agreed is further actions.
- b. Councillor Negus raised concerns that information gathered from monitoring is not being used strategically and to inform actions.
- c. It was confirmed that the Council's air quality monitoring strategy complies with guidance and the Council is monitoring in the areas it

should be. The city has very good coverage and compares favourably with other core cities. There are six nitrogen dioxide monitors and these are not just in the city centre.

- d. Concerns were raised about air quality where there is a concentration of buses e.g. Rupert Street. It was noted that there are actions being undertaken to incentivise companies to move to more electric hybrid fleets but it is expensive to replace current vehicles. It was noted that there needed to be investigation of more innovative and potentially cheaper solutions.
- e. It was also noted that transport issues were not constrained to the city boundaries and there needed to be a joint authority approach. The issue of a potential integrated transport solution was now part of the combined authority/devolution debate.

**RESOLVED:**

**That the report and the above comments / information be noted and a further update report be brought back to the Commission. The timescales for reporting back to be agreed at the next Place Planning Meeting.**

**64. Climate Change and Energy Security Framework Update**

(agenda item 11)

The commission considered a report providing an update on the framework including energy and carbon dioxide emission statistics for Bristol and progress by Bristol against its energy and Carbon dioxide targets.

Summary of main points raised / noted:

- a. It was noted that the Framework will be reviewed during 2015 and the results used to inform the development of future plans.
- b. Bristol has made good progress in implementing its ambitious Climate Change and Energy Framework and is on track with these targets when recent cold winters are taken into account.
- c. Bristol has the lowest per capita energy use and Carbon Dioxide emission of the Core Cities. Its CO<sub>2</sub> emissions are some 13% lower than the average of other Core Cities some 13% lower than the average of the other Core Cities.
- d. The Commission sought clarification on data relating to energy use and CO<sub>2</sub> emissions. The data for gas consumption used in the energy dataset is weather corrected – compensating for cold or mild winters. The data used for the CO<sub>2</sub> dataset is not weather corrected and so shows a greater annual fluctuation.

**RESOLVED: that the significant progress against targets be noted and a further report be brought to the Commission in due course.**

**65. Energy Service Update**  
(Agenda Item 12)

The Commission received a presentation covering:

- a. Update - work programme of the service**
- b. ELENA grant update**
- c. Energy company update (Due to time constraints this part of the presentation was deferred to a future meeting)**

Summary of main points raised / noted:

- a. The Commission noted consultation plans and community engagement proposals and suggested that a city wide event may be a good idea
- b. The Commission sought clarification on potential costs to households for insulation and it was clarified that this would depend on the particular householder and property
- c. Figures for potential loft insulations were queried as potentially too high. The Commission were assured that these were robust calculations based on current available data. Figures will be verified on a regular basis.
- d. In terms of the presentation the reference to 'fields' in relation to solar panels should be clarified to make it clear this is not agricultural land.
- e. In answer to a question about the commercial sector it was clarified that work is being undertaken with the commercial sector to encourage them to 'go green' supported by Business West and as part of Green Capital.
- f. It was noted that there would be real savings on energy bills and also the initiative would provide economic stimulus and real jobs in the city.
- g. The Commission queried whether there would be disincentives to private owners to carry out energy saving improvements in relation to the cost of investment versus the rate of return. Whilst this is not changing dramatically there are signs that people are becoming more energy efficient aware and the price of energy also has an impact.

**RESOLVED: to receive a further presentation on the Energy Company following councillor briefings.**

The meeting closed at 1.30pm

Chair